


OC250013

13 February 2025

Tēnā koe 

I refer to your email dated 14 January 2025, requesting the following under the Official Information Act 1982 (the Act):

This is an Official Information Act request for the Manukau Harbour port study (Tonkin & Taylor were the lead consultants) that was completed last year.

Please provide the following:

- 1. the Manukau Harbour port study.*
- 2. any advice and/or briefings to the relevant Minister about the study.*
- 3. any internal communications between Ministry staff about requests for the report from BusinessDesk reporter Oliver Lewis.*
- 4. The total cost of the study.*

Three documents fall within the scope of your request and are detailed in the document schedule included below. The schedule outlines how the documents you requested have been treated under the Act.

Doc no.	Title	Response
1	Manukau Harbour Port Feasibility Study	Withheld in full under section 9(2)(f)(iv) of the Act. The study is currently under consideration by Ministers.
2	OC240756 Manukau Harbour Port Feasibility Study – advice and next steps	Withheld in full under section 9(2)(f)(iv) of the Act. The Ministry's advice is currently under consideration by Ministers.
3	Ministry emails relating to Oli Lewis' queries on the Manukau Harbour Port Feasibility Study	One phone number is withheld under section 9(2)(a) of the Act to protect the privacy of the Ministry employee.

As per the table above, certain information in the documents listed above is withheld under the following sections of the Act:

9(2)(a)	to protect the privacy of natural persons
9(2)(f)(iv)	to maintain the constitutional conventions for the time being which protect the confidentiality of advice tendered by Ministers of the Crown and officials

The Study and our advice on the Study, including potential next steps, have been provided to Ministers for their consideration, and we are waiting to hear back from them.

In regards to the final part of your request, the total cost paid to Tonkin & Taylor to complete the study was \$1,929,570.00 (exclusive of GST).

With regard to the information that has been withheld under section 9 of the Act, I am satisfied that the reasons for withholding the information at this time are not outweighed by public interest considerations that would make it desirable to make the information available.

You have the right to seek an investigation and review of this response by the Ombudsman, in accordance with section 28(3) of the Act. The relevant details can be found on the Ombudsman's website at www.ombudsman.parliament.nz.

The Ministry publishes our Official Information Act responses, and the information contained in our reply to you may be published on the Ministry website. Before publishing, we will remove any personal or identifiable information.

Nāku noa, nā



Marian Willberg
Manager, Maritime and Freight

Document 3 – Ministry emails relating to Oli Lewis' queries on the Manukau Harbour Port Feasibility Study

Emails in 2023

From: Matthew Winthrop <M.Winthrop@transport.govt.nz>

Sent: Friday, October 13, 2023 11:12 AM

To: Supply Chain <supplychain@transport.govt.nz>

Subject: FW: BusinessDesk: Manukau Harbour study

Hi Supply Chain team,

I see Robert and Jacob are on leave today, was hoping someone could help with the media query below. I've drafted a response based on a similar recent media response to Shipping Gazette. Let me know if any comments.

The study is still underway but a final report is expected to be completed in early 2024. If you check early in the New Year we can provide an update on timing

In case he asks us why it's delayed, is there anything we can say?

Cheers,

Matt

From: Liam Fechny <L.Fechney@transport.govt.nz>

Sent: Friday, October 13, 2023 12:14 PM

To: Matthew Winthrop <M.Winthrop@transport.govt.nz>; Supply Chain <supplychain@transport.govt.nz>

Subject: RE: BusinessDesk: Manukau Harbour study

Hi Matt,

I'm not particularly in the loop with this one, but I believe the delays are weather/conditions/Auckland flooding related so you could say something along the lines of:

"With technical and environmental reports such as this one, it is important to ensure all relevant data across all possible conditions has been collected and assessed, and so minor delays are not uncommon."

I think there's also something about doing it once, and doing it correctly, to ensure decision makers can confidently rely on the findings. I'm just not sure how to wordsmith that without it sounding like a criticism of the report authors for the delay.

Liam Fechny ([he / him](#))

Kaitohutohu – Ngā Ara Whakarato | Adviser – Supply Chain

Te Manatū Waka Ministry of Transport

s 9(2)(a) | E: L.fechney@transport.govt.nz | transport.govt.nz

From: Matthew Winthrop <M.Winthrop@transport.govt.nz>
Sent: Friday, 13 October 2023 12:15 pm
To: Liam Fechney <L.Fechney@transport.govt.nz>; Supply Chain <supplychain@transport.govt.nz>
Subject: RE: BusinessDesk: Manukau Harbour study

That's great, thank you Liam. Re the main response, I checked with Bryn and he's all good with it.

From: Matthew Winthrop
Sent: Friday, October 13, 2023 2:24 PM
To: Bryn Gandy
Cc: Liam Fechney ; James Macleod
Subject: FW: BusinessDesk: Manukau Harbour study

Hi Bryn,

See Oli's follow-up question. Can I say something like,

With technical and environmental reports such as this one, it is important to ensure all relevant data across all possible conditions has been collected and assessed, and so minor delays are not uncommon.

Cheers

From: Robert Parker
Sent: Monday, October 16, 2023 11:36 AM
To: Matthew Winthrop
Cc: Liam Fechney; Jacob Ennis
Subject: RE: BusinessDesk: Manukau Harbour study

Mōrena Matthew

Thank you Liam for responding while I was on leave.

Just for some further detail (as an FYI), the fieldwork is largely completed with a focus on modelling and engagement with key stakeholders. The draft report, once completed, will also need to go through a rigorous peer review process.

Nā Rob

From: Matthew Winthrop
Sent: Monday, October 16, 2023 11:53 AM
To: Bryn Gandy
Cc: Liam Fechney; James Macleod
Subject: FW: BusinessDesk: Manukau Harbour study

Hi Bryn,

Here's the draft response below:

With technical and environmental reports such as this one, it is important to ensure all relevant data across all possible conditions has been collected and assessed, and so minor delays are not uncommon.

Emails in 2024

From: Matthew Winthrop <M.Winthrop@transport.govt.nz>

Sent: Thursday, June 27, 2024 11:29 AM

To: Marian Willberg <m.willberg@transport.govt.nz>; Callum Gill <C.Gill@transport.govt.nz>

Cc: Nick Lee <N.Lee@transport.govt.nz>

Subject: FW: BusinessDesk: Manukau Harbour study

Hi both,

See the media questions below. This is what we said most recently to media – in early June:

The final report is due back from the consultants by the end of this month. We will then need to work through the report and consider what next steps to recommend to the Minister of Transport. We expect to provide advice to the Minister in the coming months.

I don't imagine we'll be able to provide the report or the findings but we could give an update on if it's been provided to the Minister, who the consultants are – and potentially the cost?

Nick (cc'd) will pick this up from the comms side of things.

Cheers,

Matt

From: Callum Gill <C.Gill@transport.govt.nz>

Sent: Thursday, June 27, 2024 12:11 PM

To: Matthew Winthrop <M.Winthrop@transport.govt.nz>; Marian Willberg <m.willberg@transport.govt.nz>

Cc: Nick Lee <N.Lee@transport.govt.nz>; Robert Parker <R.Parker@transport.govt.nz>

Subject: RE: BusinessDesk: Manukau Harbour study

Hi Matthew

I just had a chat with Marian about this. Proposed response to each of the questions below

Hopefully this is helpful

1. Who were the consultants commissioned to carry out the study?

Tonkin & Taylor are the lead consultants.

2. How much did it cost?

We are not willing to disclose this yet – the project is still on-going.

3. When was it completed?

Actually still uncomplete, very very close to being finalised (will now be in July)

4. Has it gone to the minister? If so, when?

It will go to the Minister in the coming months once we have had time to digest the report's findings and provide our advice on it. We intend to release the report publicly once the Minister has looked at it too with our advice.

5. What was the finding as to the suitability of using Manukau Harbour for a port?

The work is not yet complete

From: Nick Lee <N.Lee@transport.govt.nz>

Sent: Thursday, June 27, 2024 1:15 PM

To: Callum Gill <C.Gill@transport.govt.nz>; Matthew Winthrop <M.Winthrop@transport.govt.nz>; Marian Willberg <m.willberg@transport.govt.nz>

Cc: Robert Parker <R.Parker@transport.govt.nz>

Subject: RE: BusinessDesk: Manukau Harbour study

Thanks Callum.

Building off what you have provided what do you think of the following statement?

The report is not expected to be publicly available until the Minister has made decisions. The report will include findings on the suitability of using Manukau Harbour as a port. In terms of timing we are still finalising our advice but expect to provide receive the report in the coming weeks and will then start the process of providing this to the Minister of Transport with our own advice. We won't be able to provide have a final cost until the completion of the work.

Thanks

Nick

From: Callum Gill <C.Gill@transport.govt.nz>

Sent: Thursday, June 27, 2024 1:33 PM

To: Nick Lee <N.Lee@transport.govt.nz>; Matthew Winthrop <M.Winthrop@transport.govt.nz>; Marian Willberg <m.willberg@transport.govt.nz>

Cc: Robert Parker <R.Parker@transport.govt.nz>

Subject: RE: BusinessDesk: Manukau Harbour study

Looks good Nick but I'm not sure what is standard procedure around releasing the price of studies? When do we do this (if at all?)

I made some other changes below

From: Matthew Winthrop <M.Winthrop@transport.govt.nz>
Sent: Thursday, June 27, 2024 2:08 PM
To: Callum Gill <C.Gill@transport.govt.nz>; Nick Lee <N.Lee@transport.govt.nz>; Marian Willberg <m.willberg@transport.govt.nz>
Cc: Robert Parker <R.Parker@transport.govt.nz>
Subject: RE: BusinessDesk: Manukau Harbour study

We do release the cost of projects – we have in past media responses but on the final cost of projects not halfway through a project. The journalist may ask why we haven't/aren't able to release project cost at this point though.

Small change in green below.

From: Nick Lee <N.Lee@transport.govt.nz>
Sent: Thursday, June 27, 2024 2:08 PM
To: Callum Gill <C.Gill@transport.govt.nz>; Marian Willberg <m.willberg@transport.govt.nz>
Matthew Winthrop <M.Winthrop@transport.govt.nz>
Cc: Robert Parker <R.Parker@transport.govt.nz>
Subject: RE: BusinessDesk: Manukau Harbour study

That's great, [@Marian Willberg](mailto:m.willberg@transport.govt.nz) are you happy with the below? If so we will run the Mins and then send out.

The report is not expected to be publicly available until the Minister has made decisions. The report will include findings on the suitability of using Manukau Harbour as a port. In terms of timing we are still finalising our advice but expect to receive the report in the coming weeks and will then start the process of providing this to the Minister of Transport with our own advice. We won't be able to provide a final cost until the completion of the work.

Thanks

Nick

From: Marian Willberg <m.willberg@transport.govt.nz>
Sent: Thursday, June 27, 2024 2:29 PM
To: Matthew Winthrop <M.Winthrop@transport.govt.nz>; Callum Gill <C.Gill@transport.govt.nz>; Nick Lee <N.Lee@transport.govt.nz>
Cc: Robert Parker <R.Parker@transport.govt.nz>
Subject: RE: BusinessDesk: Manukau Harbour study

Can I also amend "we are still finalising our advice" – I would rather indicate that we are waiting for the final report and then we will digest and consider what our advice to the Minister will be.

Marian

From: Nick Lee <N.Lee@transport.govt.nz>
Sent: Thursday, June 27, 2024 2:37 PM
To: Marian Willberg <m.willberg@transport.govt.nz>; Matthew Winthrop <M.Winthrop@transport.govt.nz>; Callum Gill <C.Gill@transport.govt.nz>
Cc: Robert Parker <R.Parker@transport.govt.nz>
Subject: RE: BusinessDesk: Manukau Harbour study

Hi Marian,

We've edited with your feedback:

The report is not expected to be publicly available until the Minister has made decisions. The report will include findings on the suitability of using Manukau Harbour as a port. In terms of timing we expect to receive the report in the coming weeks and will then start the process of providing this to the Minister of Transport with our own advice. We won't be able to provide a final cost until the completion of the work. Tonkin & Taylor are the lead consultants.

Thanks

From: Marian Willberg
Sent: Thursday, 27 June 2024 2:37 pm
To: Nick Lee <N.Lee@transport.govt.nz>; Matthew Winthrop <M.Winthrop@transport.govt.nz>; Callum Gill <C.Gill@transport.govt.nz>
Cc: Robert Parker <R.Parker@transport.govt.nz>
Subject: RE: BusinessDesk: Manukau Harbour study

I'm happy with that

Thanks

Marian

Emails in 2025

From: Matthew Winthrop <M.Winthrop@transport.govt.nz>
Sent: Monday, 13 January 2025 3:26 pm
To: Marian Willberg <m.willberg@transport.govt.nz>
Subject: FW: BusinessDesk: Manukau Harbour study

Hi Marian,

Do you know if there are any updates? I seem to recall last time we spoke about this you said the study was being consulted with other Ministers.

Cheers,

Matt

From: Marian Willberg <m.willberg@transport.govt.nz>
Sent: Monday, 13 January 2025 3:43 pm
To: Matthew Winthrop <M.Winthrop@transport.govt.nz>
Subject: RE: BusinessDesk: Manukau Harbour study

I have just checked in with Abby – they are waiting for a response from other Ministers. No idea of when any response will be received.

Thanks

Marian

From: Matthew Winthrop <M.Winthrop@transport.govt.nz>
Sent: Monday, 13 January 2025 3:49 pm
To: Marian Willberg <m.willberg@transport.govt.nz>
Subject: RE: BusinessDesk: Manukau Harbour study

Thanks for checking. Looks like an OIA is coming in any case.

I'll tell Oli we don't have any further updates since our last email. We'll update you as soon as we can.

Sound ok?

From: Marian Willberg <m.willberg@transport.govt.nz>
Sent: Monday, 13 January 2025 4:03 pm
To: Matthew Winthrop <M.Winthrop@transport.govt.nz>
Subject: RE: BusinessDesk: Manukau Harbour study

Sounds good

From: Matthew Winthrop <M.Winthrop@transport.govt.nz>
Sent: Tuesday, 14 January 2025 10:18 am
To: Marian Willberg <m.willberg@transport.govt.nz>
Subject: FW: BusinessDesk: Manukau Harbour study

Hi Marian – see follow up query. Is this an answer?

The study is currently with the Minister of Transport, and we're not able to release it publicly until the Minister has considered the findings and provided any feedback.